

## Understanding the Values of Civility: A Review of Educational Literature Through Five Analytical Lenses

**Aziz Ouladhadda**

*Instructor and Researcher at Ecole Normale Supérieure, Mohammed V University in Rabat, Morocco*

[azizouladhadda@gmail.com](mailto:azizouladhadda@gmail.com)

**Adil Azhar**

*Professor of Applied Linguistics and TEFL, Mohammed V University in Rabat, Morocco*

How to cite:

Ouladhadda, A. & Azhar, A. (2025). Understanding the Values of Civility: A Review of Educational Literature Through Five Analytical Lenses. *International Journal of Linguistics and Translation Studies* 6(2).129-157.

<https://doi.org/10.36892/ijlts.v6i2.589>

### ARTICLE HISTORY

Received:  
11/04/2025

Accepted:  
25/05/2025

### Keywords:

EFL Materials  
- Moroccan  
Education -  
School  
Civility-  
Classroom  
Behavior -  
Teacher  
Training -  
Values  
Education..

### Abstract

This literature review explores the concept of school civility with the aim of making existing international research accessible and relevant to Moroccan researchers and educators. The paper begins by examining how civility has been defined across disciplines and identifies its core components and educational functions. Drawing on peer-reviewed studies retrieved from reputable databases such as Scopus, Web of Science, Springer, JSTOR, and Science Direct, the review categorizes the literature into five thematic areas: (1) pedagogical strategies for teaching values, (2) the role of teacher training programs in values education, (3) the presence of civility in English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teaching materials, (4) students' and teachers' perceptions of civil and uncivil behaviors, and (5) contextual factors correlated with school incivility. The findings suggest that while various interventions and strategies have been proposed and tested globally, there remain significant gaps in values education, particularly within teacher training programs and EFL curricula. The review concludes by identifying areas that warrant empirical investigation in the Moroccan context, offering a framework for future research on promoting civility in schools.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

In recent decades, the notion of school civility has gained increasing attention in educational discourse at the international level, including in Morocco. While schools constantly strive to create inclusive, respectful, and productive environments, civility is increasingly viewed not only as a behavioral expectation but also as a pedagogical objective that schools have to achieve. (Clark & Carnosso, 2008; Nucci et al., 2014). Researchers from various academic fields, such as education, psychology, and sociology, have explored the topic by offering diverse definitions, empirical data, and theoretical frameworks. While some of these have emphasized civility as a set of interpersonal norms promoting respect and cooperation (Pearson et al., 2001), others have underscored its broader roles in shaping democratic values

and fostering positive school climates (Berkowitz & Bier, 2005; Cohen, 2006). In both cases, we clearly understand that civility is foundational to an ethical school culture where effective learning can take place. (Narvaez, 2002; Thornberg, 2008). This article aims to provide Moroccan researchers with a comprehensive overview of existing research on school civility as it is tackled within values education. It begins with a conceptual mapping of how the term has been defined and understood across the literature, identifying key components such as respect, tolerance, empathy, responsibility, and active engagement. The article, then, attempts to offer a synthesis of empirical findings categorized into five thematic areas. This thematic structure is intended to suggest the main aspects of school civility that perhaps need to be explored in depth by researchers in the Moroccan educational context.

The first theme discusses pedagogical strategies for integrating the teaching of values in the classroom, and this is believed to offer evidence-based insights on curriculum design and instructional methods. The second explores how teacher training programs have addressed, or rather overlooked, the cultivation of civility-related values among trainee teachers. The third theme examines how civility is embedded, or absent, in EFL teaching materials across the world, an area of particular relevance to Moroccan classrooms, given that textbooks serve as a source of both language input and value transmission. The fourth theme delves into how both students and teachers perceive civil and uncivil behaviors, revealing significant gaps between normative expectations and lived experiences of the school stakeholders. Finally, the fifth theme investigates contextual variables, such as school culture, media exposure, and socio-economic conditions that are found to correlate with the spread of school incivility.

By trying to summarize existing literature on the values of civility, the present paper not only maps current knowledge on the topic but also stresses an urgent need for context-specific investigations in Morocco to reduce levels of school incivility. It is hoped that this review will serve as a springboard for local scholars, educators, and policymakers to engage critically with the concept and contribute to a more civil and values-driven educational environment.

## **2. CIVILITY: DEFINITIONS, COMPONENTS, AND FUNCTIONS**

Before delving into the five thematic areas set as main objectives for the current paper, it is crucial to begin with an attempt to trace how different scholars have defined the term and what components and functions they have associated with it. Boyd (2006), as a first example, argues that the values of civility are indispensable in modern urban societies. Such values are needed for their ability to resolve conflicts and improve communication and, thus, make social interaction easy. Modern societies are characterized by pluralism, which resulted from migration and which led to the coexistence of multiple races, ethnicities, religions, and heritages. Civility, then, has an inclusionary dimension. Boyd focused mainly on the functional role of civility. He justified this by the fact that incivility is “disruptive and socially divisive” (Boyd, p. 874). However, he also noted that this is only one dimension of civility. The second, and the most important one, is that civility is a moral obligation that should be considered in isolation from its functions in establishing social order.

More importantly, perhaps, Boyd (2006) attempts to provide a definition of the term civility. While doing so, he first points out to the big challenge academics face while trying to define the term civility. To explain this challenge, he wrote that “this difficulty is compounded by the fact that civility and the related concept of civil society have undergone significant transformations in their history” (p. 863). This in fact refers to the ever-changing nature of values and values system of human societies, no matter how slow such change might be. The

second reason why it is difficult to define civility is that it is situated in the middle between social norms and legal texts on the one hand and between private and public life on the other.

Boyd (2006) lists two distinct meanings associated with the concept of civility. First, it is often used to refer to the everyday formalities that characterize direct interactions between people. This includes being polite, courteous, well-mannered, respectful, and sympathetic. Second, the term is used to refer to belonging to a political community, assuming responsibilities, and performing duties. “This sense of the term civility is most evident in formulations like ‘civil rights’ or ‘civil disobedience,’ where the modifier ‘civil’ refers to the condition of being a member of a political community” (Boyd, 2006, p. 864). He then tries to relate the two meanings by emphasizing that it is membership in a political community that requires from us a degree of politeness towards other citizens.

For Boyd (2006), the new meaning of civility is a bit distinct from Christian beliefs concerning virtue and morality. It is simply “a looser kind of moral obligation we owe to strangers” (Boyd 2006, p. 866). Examples include avoiding mockery, rudeness, and disdain. The need for such qualities or dispositions, according to Boyd, stemmed from the modern socioeconomic field wherein informal interactions between merchants and clients are structured around respect and courtesy.

Similarly, civility is rooted in the democratic ideals of moral equality. The latter simply means that all people deserve fair treatment characterized by respect for human dignity. This disposition makes civility functional; it maintains peace, order, harmony, and reduces conflicts in society.

However, what leaves some frustration in Boyd’s definition and discussion of civility is that he confined it only to the urban context. He wrote: “I have argued for the value of civility and its special relevance for contemporary urban life” (Boyd, 2006, p. 874). The rural world seems unconcerned with the debate Boyd brought up in his essay. This research is about civility in Moroccan schools, be them located in urban or rural areas. What Boyd said about civility in urban zones can arguably apply to civility in rural zones as well if we bear in mind the nature of the school itself. The school, even in rural areas, is an assembly or gathering of many people with different backgrounds, and this is what Boyd called pluralism, a feature that justifies the need for civility.

Peck (2002), as a second example, tackled the issue of civility by first talking about a decline in morality despite the diverse social control policies adopted in many contexts. In this regard, he shared Boyd’s idea that civility is vital for establishing social order. He, then, traces how the concept of civility changed meanings over historical periods. In doing so, he relied on eclectic literature that dealt with civility as a concept and as a virtue. He started from Aristotle’s notion that civility is a condition when people treat each other in a civil way regardless of differences at the level of political views or attitudes. This definition of civility survived until the 18<sup>th</sup> century, although the term civilization was used interchangeably with it. To illustrate this, Peck (2002) quotes Bryant (1995, p. 145):

Civility bespeaks a common standard within which a multiplicity of ways of living, working, and associating are tolerated. It demands that in all life outside the home we afford each other certain decencies and comforts as fellow citizens, regardless of other differences between us. (Peck, 2002, p. 360)

Until that time, civility was discussed in urban contexts solely. Peck notes that from a classical perspective, civilized people are those who can live in the city and assume citizenship roles and duties, while countryside people, often described as ill-mannered and barbarian were deemed unconcerned with this debate.

Peck then highlights contemporary meanings which the term civility has today. The concept nowadays includes virtues such as politeness, tolerance, good manners, cooperation, and good treatment of others in general. He wrote: “To be civil in common ordinary usage

means that one is a polite, respectful, decent person. Civility is a quality that requires the restraint of angry emotion directed toward others” (Peck, 2002, pp. 361,362). These traits, just as Boyd (2006) mentioned, are primordial for interaction between individuals and groups. ETC

A significant notion explained by Peck (2002) is that civility is a learned behavior rather than being a natural disposition that humans are born with. It is to be preached through moral education. Obligations towards others have to be taught, just as social expectations have to be made explicit to learners. This is similar to the functionalist views of schools as sites of socialization, and tools to transmit skills and cultural norms and values needed for the performance of future roles.

James Kauffman, as a third example, tackles civility in the educational context in his article entitled *Creating a Climate of Classroom Civility* published in 1997. He defines incivility as the escalation of violence which is proved by different reports and statistical studies in the USA. This fact made civility the concern of politicians and educators alike starting from the mid-nineties. Kauffman (1997) then defines civility from educational perspectives or as it should be manifested in educational institutions. He wrote that “more pertinent to our discussion (the context of education) is the definition of civility as politeness or courtesy” (p. 320). He reports that most Americans think that the increase in violence and aggressive behavior is mainly attributed to the decline of civility. It is this stained climate that usually impacts students’ wellbeing and teachers’ professional performance. Kauffman suggests four basic areas within which civility can be promoted:

**- Engage In Self-Analysis**

Teachers should adopt a strategy of introspection. That is to say, teachers should revisit their own prejudices and reflect critically on their own values and behaviors. “We noted earlier that nearly 90% of Americans believe incivility is a problem in American life. Astonishingly, 99% say their own behavior is civil! It seems most unlikely to us that the perceived decay of civility is caused by only one in a hundred Americans” (Kauffman, 1997, p. 322). Everyone seems to put the blame on everyone else when it comes to the rise of incivility. Teachers, hence, should reconsider their own ways of interacting with students. This is pertinent bearing in mind some students’ testimonies that their teachers often engage in unnecessary confrontations.

**- Imagine a climate of civility**

Teachers should believe in change and in their ability to contribute into bringing it about. They should be optimistic about improving the classroom climate to become space of cooperation, consideration, respect and self-governance. It is that optimism which can guarantee better understanding of how to build moral commitment between students, and to build stronger relations with them.

**- Build a repertoire of initiatives and responses**

So that educators could reduce antisocial behaviors in school, they should be proactive. Kaufman lists six suggested measures teachers should commit to: monitoring at least one child a year, stopping aggression early by treating the minor misbehaviors that often lead to it, adopting relevant punishment to antisocial behavior, training students on conflict management skills, sensitizing them about violence in the media, and establishing an anxiety-free classroom environment..

**- Make a commitment to persist**

Because “there will be setbacks, periods of confusion, and probably some moments of despair” (Kaufman, 1997, p. 324), establishing and maintaining a culture of civility in the classroom requires stamina, determination, commitment, and continuous effort. Fighting

incivility and antisocial behaviors should be regarded as part and parcel of the mission of educators.

A fourth scholar who was interested in the diverse meanings the term civility has is Abbott L. Ferriss. For him, sociologists have focused on dysfunctional behavior or conduct more than functional one such as civility, which has contributed to leaving the concept unclear and often ambiguous. He notes that the study of civility, just like the study of any given phenomenon, necessitates defining it first. .

Interestingly, He defines civility in a straightforward manner as “consideration of others in interpersonal relationships” (Ferriss, 2002, p. 376). He adds, however, another element which previously listed definitions did not include: anger management. Ferriss stressed that the ability to manage anger is a crucial component of civility as this personality trait helps in avoiding conflict while in interpersonal communication. In addition, by relying on diverse USA surveys and statistics centers, Ferriss (2002) concluded that civility correlates with age; the older people get, the more civility they show towards others. On the other hand, civility is not related to gender as available statistics in the USA showed no difference in the mean score between men and women.

A significant contribution into attempts to understand civility is what Wilkens et al. (2010) included in their article entitled “Implications of Civility for Children and Adolescents: A Review of the Literature, published in 2010. This article, which relied on a rich bibliography, referred to all the scholars mentioned in this section in addition to many others (38 scholars who defined the term civility). In doing so, it listed numerous definitions of the term civility as it has been used historically, and it offered insights into why civility as a virtue is needed today. Table 1 below includes the keywords as well as general statements which were used to define civility.

**Table 1. Key terms and expressions used to describe civility in Wilkens et al. (2010)**

Key components of civility	Outcomes of civil behaviors	Contributors to incivility
Respect Consideration Gentility Courtesy Selflessness Decency Self-control Anger management Empathy Honesty Morality Tolerance	Maintaining of a functioning society Establishing social order and social harmony Improving social harmony Improving communication Promoting collaboration Encouraging care for the common good Reducing hostility and aggression	Media influence Pervasiveness of technology Weakening of families Negative school environment Decline of civic responsibility Individualism Over focus on academic contents

### 3. INTERNATIONAL EMPIRICAL RESEARCH ON VALUES AND SCHOOL CIVILITY

A huge body of research on values education and school civility has been conducted in many contexts. This section is devoted to exploring how different researchers around the world, and in different historical eras, have tackled the topic. The studies included are categorized into five themes, which include 1) pedagogical tips to incorporate the teaching of values, 2) values in teacher training programs, 3) values education in EFL materials, 4) students and teachers' perception of civility/ incivility, and 5) contextual variables correlating with school incivility. Studies in this section were published in reputable peer-reviewed journals and



were cited many times by other researchers. Most of these were retrieved from recognized databases such as Scopus, Web of Science, Springer, Jstor, and Science Direct.

### **3.1. Pedagogical Tips to Incorporate the Teaching of Values**

In this section, empirical research offering practical insights into how to include moral education in daily classroom activities is sketched out. First, two crucial studies, both of which are literature reviews, are discussed; the first comprised studies from 1995 to 2003, while the second included publication from 2009 to 2019. The two studies are complementary as they brought together all the themes addressed in international research on values and morality. After this, separate studies are included to be as exhaustive as possible with regard to the topic of this section.

#### **3.1.1. Moral Education: a Review of Teaching Strategies**

Schuitema et al., (2007) present a significant review of the literature dealing with pedagogical tips to incorporate moral education into secondary school curricula. The authors first note that instructional strategies to foster prosocial behavior in previous literature are relatively scarce, and that the majority of existing research focuses on the ‘what’ and the ‘why’, meaning the goals of moral education in secondary schools. This is problematic in their view due to the decline in morality and ethical conduct in recent years.

Methodologically, the study reviewed literature pertaining to teaching strategies for moral education from 1995 to 2003. In doing so, the authors relied only on high quality studies published in reference databases such as ERIC and Web of Science, with particular focus on reputable journals like *Journal of Moral Education* and *Journal for Curriculum Studies*. The total number of studies reached 76, which definitely helped in bringing much insight into the topic under investigation.

On the one hand, about half of the studies revolved around the goals of moral education in preparing students for active participation in social life through fostering critical thinking skills, informed moral decision making. Other studies concluded that the ultimate aim of moral education is to explicitly teach a “specific set of values, such as trustworthiness, respect, responsibility, honesty, justice, and fairness” (Schuitema et al., 2007, p.15). For these studies, focus on limited and widely accepted values can prevent the discussion on moral relativism and the question of universality. On the other hand, 39 studies, out of 76, provided specific pedagogical tips to teach morality. These tips can be classified in 3 groups: problem based instructional methods, cooperation in a cooperative learning environment, and classroom discussions

To start with, problem solving approaches in education are credited for their positive impact on students’ cognitive skills like critical thinking and informed decision making. In the context of moral education, effective implementation of such approaches could generally develop students’ moral reasoning and their moral decision making mechanisms. Studies that suggested the adoption of problem based methods are generally based on Kohlberg’s theory of moral development, with its emphasis on cognitive mechanisms leading to the formation of moral judgements.

Second, cooperative learning was suggested in many studies and it was argued for as an effective pedagogical channel through which values can be transmitted to students. Group work as a specific instructional technique is believed to push students to practice communication skills and develop positive attitudes towards peers and teachers; these include respect, tolerating disagreement, and accepting others. Group work activities are grounded in Dewey’s educational discourse. Dewey believed that learning by doing, in a group work context, leads to the development of positive personality assets such as caring about others, social engagement, and altruism. However, cooperative learning necessarily requires a

classroom environment characterized by democracy, openness, and tolerance. In fact, “democracy can only be taught in a democratic environment” (Schuitema et al., 2007, p. 6). In this regard, students must be involved in as many decision making opportunities as possible in the classroom. Also, the teacher should be knowledgeable about students’ cultural diversity and make explicit comments about the need for coexistence and tolerance as these are preconditions for group work.

Third, a number of studies according to Schuitema et.al, (2007) recommended classroom discussions as pedagogical tools to preach values. Having students engage in structured interpersonal interactions inside the classroom can immensely enhance their prosocial behavior and ultimately lead to an ideal atmosphere of acceptance, open-mindedness, and respect. Classroom discussions are mostly encouraged in the teaching of languages as there is no particular content which has to be learned and tested in the language class. Issues that pertain to values and morality, like alcohol abuse or violence, could be the topic of oral tasks, a reading text, or a writing assignment whose functions are respectively to develop students’ skills in speaking, reading and writing. In addition to this, the language class can offer opportunities to discuss drama and literature, two fields wherein lessons on ethics and values are abundant. Thanks to these two subjects, “students can learn the values of their cultural inheritance” (Schuitema et.al., p. 10).

The authors concluded with the recommendation that “values must be discussed in the framework of a specific subject area and that enhancing students’ critical-thinking skills should be taught in the context of meaningful, rich, domain-specific subject matter” (Schuitema et.al., p. 16). Moral education has only been included as an extra-curricular content distributed over many subjects. This made the teaching of values less effective.

### 3.1.2. Implementing Values Education: What roles for teachers?

Mohamed et al., (2020) attempted to sketch out practical roles for teachers. Interestingly, they began their study with a concise definition of values education as “a process to form individuals with ethical perspectives of morals that will influence their thinking, actions, and character in the future” (Mohamed et al., p. 5292). They described the relationship between values and education as inseparable, and they gave it other labels such as citizenship education, moral education, and civics education. Values education is needed today according to the authors primarily because most societies are facing a crisis in values and a decline in morality, and because values are vital for performing future roles. This is completely in line with previous research discussed in various previous sections of the current study. Mohamed et al. tackled the issue of values from the perspective of teachers to list various professional practices deemed necessary to foster the appropriation of relevant ethical behaviors and codes of conduct.

Methodologically, the authors reviewed articles published between 2009 and 2019. Just like Schuitema et al. (2007), they relied only on high-quality peer-reviewed articles which were retrieved from two reputable databases, namely Web of Science and Scopus. The authors engaged in strict criteria based selection of studies in that “only article journals with empirical data are accepted, which means review article, book series, chapter in a book, and conference proceedings are all rejected” (Mohamed et al., 2020, p. 5294). The selection process resulted in identifying a total of 185 articles, 107 from Scopus and 78 from Web of Science. Interestingly, the selected articles revolved around teachers’ roles in values education in many contexts such as Indonesia, Japan, Hong Kong, Canada, the USA, South Africa, and Croatia. Close analysis of the selected studies yielded three themes that pertain to teachers' roles in values education: educators as role models, educators' skills, and educators' teamwork spirit.

Teachers can be efficient in preaching positive values simply by being a role models for students. Teachers’ own system of values, conducts, attitudes, and personality traits can inspire

those around them and guide them into a process of positive imitation that in the long run will result in the acquisition of positive values. Teachers who are good role models are those who build good rapport and humane relationships with students, show tolerance to different views and cultural backgrounds in school, and make no “compromises on matters of ethics because it will affect students’ life” (Mohamed et al., 2020, p. 5297).

Teachers’ competencies were the prime focus of 11 reviewed articles. The classroom teacher first needs a deep understanding of what values are and how vital they are in educational processes. Theoretical knowledge of moral philosophies, concepts from ethical theories and the pivotal place of values in education must be clear in the teacher's mind. Second, he or she needs many necessary skills to plan and deliver instructional materials whose intended learning outcomes are value appropriation or appreciation. Particular lessons should, from time to time, aim at providing ample opportunities to describe values and discuss them critically in class explicitly. Some of the literature reviewed by Mohamed et al. (2020) suggests that teachers need particular skills to ensure a cooperative learning environment, prevent discriminatory attitudes in class, and assess values related learning outcomes. In this regard, the role of continuous professional development is crucial. It is the only recipe capable of updating teachers’ professional practices and beliefs.

The third theme emerging from Mohamed et al., 2020 relates to the roles of teachers’ cooperation in efficient implementation of values education. What is meant by collaboration is teachers’ willingness to communicate with parents and other educational stakeholders with the general aim of developing the student’s personality. Maintaining a good and sustainable relationship with parents can indeed be challenging for teachers but its outcomes in the values domain are rewarding; collaboration results in sharing knowledge about values and in exchanging views and practical tips on how to deal with values-related school phenomena.

Mohamed et al. (2020) concluded their study by stressing the pivotal role teachers are expected to perform in values education according to the 185 empirical studies they reviewed. The challenge is that, in many cases, teachers are not knowledgeable about how values can be included on a regular basis into the curriculum which they implement. For this reason, “teachers need to comprehend at least the basic concept of values, terminology, and pedagogical knowledge that underpin their subject” (Mohamed et al., p. 5299).

### **3.1.3. A Survey of School Professionals Responses to Students’ Incivility**

In their widely cited article, Wilkins et al. (2010) first pointed to the scarcity of empirical research on students’ civil behavior around the world, and this served as justification for the study’s relevance. Data collected from 251 school professionals revealed the participants’ perception that civil behavior is more observable and frequent than uncivil behavior in the institutions targeted by the study. Yet, most of them insisted on the need to improve civil behavior due to the impact it has on everyday school life.

The authors made the claim that the increased emphasis of modern educational systems on the academic dimension of schooling was often at the expense of teaching values of civil behavior that were prioritized before. The result of this is that “civility is fading both as a virtue and as a behavior” (Wilkins et.al., 2010, p. 540).

However, efforts to resolve the problem, according to the literature review conducted by the authors, resulted in implementing interventions within the school. Some schools worked on the development of students’ social skills including problem solving, conflict resolution strategies, anger management, and engagement in community service. Other institutions tried sensitizing students about the real attitudes and beliefs of their peers concerning uncivil behaviors. Many students take it for granted that uncivil behavior is acceptable and welcomed by peers, which is mostly not the case. In fact, many students behave uncivilly simply because



they think that by doing so they will conform to peers' expectations. Last but not least, establishing good rapport between students and the administrative staff worked well in many schools. Administrators are encouraged to be close to students and constantly ask about their problems, disputes, and worries. This strategy is believed to increase mutual respect and trust, two ingredients that would ultimately reduce school incivility.

As for the methodology, the term civility was first defined as "behaviors that show respect towards a person in order to maintain social harmony or recognize the humanity of that person. Because this was exploratory research, civility was defined broadly to ensure that no important civil behavior was overlooked" (Wilkins et al., 2010, p. 543).

The study was quantitative in nature, and the sample included 251 school professionals, with 29% states of the USA represented. A 30-item questionnaire was used, the first 29 of which aimed at getting data on students' civil and uncivil behavior as observed by informants, and they were analyzed descriptively and inferentially. The last item was an open-ended question about suggested solutions to increase civil behavior in schools, and it was coded and analyzed separately. Questions in the survey were adapted from The School Social Behavior Scales (2<sup>nd</sup> edition) (Merrell, 2002), and a piloting stage was conducted with 10 school professionals.

Three main findings sum up the results of this study. First, civil behaviors were perceived to be more frequent than uncivil behaviors. These include being on time for class, dressing up properly, greeting others appropriately, using polite expressions, showing awareness of others' needs...etc. Uncivil behaviors, such as making sarcastic remarks, quarreling, complaining, littering classrooms, and using offensive language, were regarded as occurring less. Second, civil behavior was valued by a higher percentage of elementary students than secondary students, according to informants, and uncivil behavior was reported more by participants who belonged to secondary education. Third, participants suggested seven measures or intervention ideas to increase school civility:

- Direct instruction on the values of civility.
- Involving family and other social institutions.
- Modeling.
- Providing rules and expectations.
- Investing in character education.
- Adopting strict policies wherein incivility is not tolerated.
- Encouraging positive behavior in schools.

Significantly, this study reveals that issues of incivility are more common in secondary schools than at other levels. This paper is primarily intended for researchers interested in exploring the topic within Moroccan schools, which have increasingly become sites of various forms of inappropriate behavior and misconduct.

#### **4. VALUES EDUCATION IN TEACHER TRAINING PROGRAMS**

Empirical research on values education is varied as it has dealt with many aspects of the issue in different educational and geographic contexts. In this section, sample studies are reported and discussed with the objective of summarizing current research interests. These studies, although they were carried out in different contexts, reached more or less the same conclusion: teacher training programs need to provide more space for values education.

##### **4.1.Character Education in Teachers' Training**

A leading British study conducted in 2007 by Lynn Revell and James Arthur examined student teachers' perceptions of values-related content in pre-service training in two British

universities. The study included teachers of many subjects of the national curriculum. The authors justified the choice of this sample by stating that research on education often neglects to consider the perspectives of trainee teachers and that their views and perceptions would be echoed in one way or another in their future practices.

In terms of methodology, the author first defined character education and its overlapping meaning with moral education and citizenship education in the UK. They shared the view of many scholars who “believe that at the heart of character education are the beliefs that responsible behavior should be taught” (Revell & Arthur, 2007, p. 80). Such a definition is crucial as it is in line with how the current research defines school civility.

The authors used a case study design. Two cohorts of teacher trainees, 1013 participants in two universities, filled two questionnaires, one at the beginning and the other at the end of the training courses. All subjects of the national curriculum were represented to guarantee comprehensiveness. The first questionnaire asked questions related to trainees’ expectations with regard to the inclusion of values education, while the second questionnaire asked whether the initial training prepared them to teach values and whether they observed any values teaching in the host institution they were in.

Most informants expected that the pre-service training would include content related to value education. They expected some sort of explicit instruction on how to influence students’ values and behaviors directly. Interestingly, “(82%) said that they expected their course to teach them how to encourage pupils to behave and act in an appropriate manner” (Revell & Arthur, 2007, p. 83). This reflects an awareness that school contexts are perceived as challenging, and to be able to meet these challenges, comprehensive teacher training is a must.

946 student teachers returned the second questionnaire. Data revealed that, although most informants think there is a role to be played by teachers in values education, 75 % of them are convinced that factors outside the school play important roles in developing students’ values and behaviors. More importantly, 61 % of participants expressed the view that more input relating to values education is needed in the pre-service training. Concerning student teachers’ classroom observation, the data revealed that the classes observed place little emphasis on the teaching of values, with the exception of the religious education class where contents on values and ethics were present.

#### **4.2. Teachers' Self Efficacy in Teaching Character Education**

Waters and Russell (2014) aimed to measure student teachers’ beliefs in their capacities to undertake values education after their graduation in the United States. The authors justified the choice of the topic by two reasons. First, many American educational stakeholders and policymakers today “are considering the question of their responsibility for educating students about democratic principles and moral values as a vital part of a teacher's role” (Waters & Russell, 2014, p. 45). Second, training students on values and ethics has been one of the oldest educational objectives targeted by many systems all over the world. The American school had, in fact, contributed to reducing some types of delinquent behaviors including “racism, teen violence, teen pregnancy, low self-esteem, sexually transmitted diseases, drug and alcohol abuse” (Waters & Russell, p. 45). However, things have changed recently as the major focus of education started to be limited to skills and contents which are to be tested in traditional, formal modes of assessment.

The authors define character education in a way that the concept includes the key elements that this research has put together to define school civility. They quoted the definition used by the US Department of Education Office of Safe and Drug-Free Schools (2006), p.1:

Character education is a learning process that enables students and adults in a school community to understand, care about, and act on core ethical values such as respect, justice, civic virtue, and citizenship, and responsibility for self and others.

Upon such core values, we form the attitudes and actions that are the hallmark of safe, healthy, and informed communities that serve as the foundation of our society (Waters & Russell, 2014, p. 45).

The concept of efficacy used in the study is borrowed from the theory of self-efficacy by Albert Bandura (1977). It is the confident belief in one's abilities to experiment success in a given situation. The authors further distinguished between personal teacher efficacy and general teacher efficacy. The first refers to the internal level which includes knowledge, skill, and abilities, while the second refers to the extent to which external environmental factors related to students, their families, and school climate, can be controlled. The study aimed at examining both types of self-efficacy.

Methodologically, the study is within the quantitative tradition. 130 teacher trainees from the University of Florida provided numeral data by filling a survey. The researchers opted for a tested and valid research instrument, namely the Character Education Efficacy and Belief Instrument, which was developed in 2002 by Milson and Mehlig. The survey included 24 items to measure the degree of student teachers' preparedness to undertake the task of character education. 12 items were intended to measure personal teacher efficacy (PTE) and 12 to measure general teacher efficacy (GTE).

The authors described their results in a detailed way by analyzing each of the 24 questionnaire items separately. Generally, however, participants showed "a moderately low level of personal teacher efficacy (PTE) and general teacher efficacy (GTF) about character education based on their responses" (Waters & Russell, 2014, p. 51). Informants, then, are not confident in their abilities to change certain character traits in their students. A t-test and a one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) revealed a lack of any statistically significant differences for the participants scores based on grouping variables like gender, ethnicity, and program major. This general uncertainty expressed by participants show that the preservice training fails to increase their self-efficacy with regard values education.

Although some informants felt confident in their ability to act as role models in preaching good behaviors and good personality traits, they have doubts regarding the most effective methods for directly addressing particular character attributes like integrity, courtesy, and respect. Hence, it seems that student teachers have some theoretical knowledge which they are unable to convert to concrete classroom practices to encourage the acquisition of prosocial behavior. Again, this can be justified in terms of the quality of the training program in its components that relate to character education. According to the study, only 51% of the research population reported benefiting from courses on character education, which confirmed prior research that pre service teacher training does not train teachers as character educators.

The authors concluded by stating that their findings are problematic for many programs of character education and for many state legislatures. These always include contents related to morality to be taught in local schools. Yet, and due to teachers' lack of confidence to teach such content as the study revealed, the failure of the American school in its moralizing mission is logically predicted.

Almost the same situation exists in the Moroccan educational discourse. The Moroccan philosophy of education, as sketched out in many official texts such as the NCET, explicitly includes the values component as a major goal area for education in Morocco. The school has a double mission in teaching skills and contents on the one hand and prosocial behavior and national values on the other. Part of this research will mimic the study of Waters and Russell and attempt to check whether teacher training programs in Morocco are in line with the general educational policy when it comes to values education.

#### 4.3. Training on Dealing with School Violence

School civility in the current paper is partly defined as avoiding antisocial behavior like violence. The latter is the topic of Sela-Shayovitz's empirical study, which, like the study conducted by Waters and Russels (2014), discussed in the previous section, measured personal teacher efficacy (PTE). However, Sela-Shayovitz (2009) added two more indicators. The first one is teachers' efficacy in the school as an organization (TESO). This is related to perceptions about the levels of support and cooperation teachers receive from the school organization. The second one was teachers' outcome efficacy (TOE); and it refers to teachers' beliefs in their abilities to react pedagogically to violent classroom events. The three indicators were derived from factor analysis used in data analysis.

The author referred to schools as an arena of violent behaviors. Violence in the research context takes different forms and directions; incidents in schools often involve students, a student and an educator, or even staff members. However, the scope of the study is narrowed down to aim at checking the possible relationship between teacher training programs on prevention and teachers' self-efficacy in dealing with students' violent behavior. The author chose teacher training as area of investigation to shift the traditional focus in dealing with the issue from students to other actors. In fact "effective prevention programs that focus on multiple domains are more effective than those that focus only on the individual level. The success of the prevention program is enhanced by combining several emphases, i.e., targeting students, school staff training, and home-school cooperation" (Sela-Shayovitz, 2009, p. 1062).

The study aims to answer two research questions. The first one was concerned with checking for a correlation between benefiting from a violence prevention program and teachers' perceived self-efficacy in dealing with violence. The second question intended to explore the possible impacts of some sociodemographic variables relating to age, gender, educational background, and professional experience. The research population consisted of 147 teachers (82% were teachers, and 18% were preservice graduates.) 41.4% of the whole group did participate in a violence prevention program and they belonged to elementary and secondary education.

The study used an exploratory sequential design. During the first phase, the researcher collected qualitative data via interviews, and at a second phase qualitative finding were used to build an instrument to reach broader population. The survey consisted of 35 items, and it was piloted among 30 teachers to assure validity and reliability.

For the first research question, T-test analyses revealed that there were important differences in teachers' perceived outcome efficacy in dealing with violence. Teachers who received training in violence prevention displayed higher self-efficacy in dealing with violent behavior. Interestingly the differences were noted at the level of the two indicators under study, PTE, and TOE. On the other hand, significant difference in self-efficacy was observed between teachers and student teachers, which may imply that professional experience in the classroom does contribute to raising confidence in dealing with the phenomenon.

For the second research question, an OLS regression analysis showed that the variables of gender and academic background had no impact on TOE. However, the latter is correlated significantly with the level of the institution (that is primary or secondary); primary school teachers and trainees reported higher self-efficacy compared to those working in high school. This indicates that issues of violence are more challenging in high school due to the age of students (teenage or adolescence). TESO, finally, was found to have an impact on TOE. That is, the self-efficacy of teachers who work in institutions that provide support and cooperation is higher. This is quite natural as violence, like any other challenging issue, requires collaboration, teamwork and mutual support among professionals.

The author concluded by asserting that the correlation between teachers' self-efficacy and their participation in violence prevention programs show that these programs are needed today. They are very important as they "placed emphasis on practical aspects of dealing with violent behavior rather than on changing the teachers' general attitudes towards the problem" (Sela-Shayovitz, 2009, p. 1065). In this regard, the study is in line with the two studies reviewed earlier in this section. There seems to be a consensus over the crucial role that teacher training, both preservice and in-service, plays in preparing teachers to deal with the challenges emanating from students' violent behavior.

## 5. VALUES EDUCATION IN EFL MATERIALS

In this section, three studies relating to the inclusion of values in EFL textbooks are discussed. The studies were conducted in diverse contexts, namely Indonesia, China, and Palestine. The common thing among these contexts is that they are examples of heterogeneous societies where many social groups coexist. Again, the choice of these studies was informed by their publication in recognized peer reviewed journals, and this explains the many citations they received.

### 5.1. Values in Indonesian EFL Textbooks

Widodo (2018) confirmed that integrating values education in English language teaching has been considered in a number of educational contexts worldwide, but examining used textbooks for values-related contents has received little attention. Hence, the author argued that EFL textbooks should be seen as sociocultural objects that highlight specific moral principles and personality traits. This would certainly help students appropriate positive values deemed necessary for social interaction both inside and outside the school. Interestingly, the author offered a definition for character education first, and the objective of this was to avoid conceptual ambiguity that relates to the field in general as referred to in earlier sections of this research. He wrote that:

Character education is an attempt to instill in students important core values or virtues through the implementation of a school curriculum, for instance. These core virtues can take the form of cultural beliefs and knowledge, which may contain moral values, such as diligence, respect for authority, modesty, tolerance, and honesty (Widodo, 2018, p. 133)

In the Indonesian context, a character education policy was developed in 2011, and it declared this area of education to be a shared responsibility among all subjects of the national curriculum, including English. This looks similar, not to say identical, to the Moroccan educational policy in the area of values education.

In this study, a critical micro-semiotic discourse analysis was used to scan one the textbooks in use for social conventions and norms, cultural values and moral beliefs. This methodology is justified by its ability to describe in depth how value discourses are constructed within the teaching material under study. The declared objective of the study is to make both teachers and students aware that each text, picture, listening passage or activity in a textbook contains some values which are derived from sociocultural conventions. In fact, this textbook analysis emphasizes the concealed values that both educators and students should be conscious of.

Results revealed that the textbook *Pathway to English for Senior High School Grade X* does highlight sets of values listed in official guidelines. These include care, politeness, nationalism, patriotism, self-esteem, honesty, responsibility, tolerance, hard work, respect, trust, integrity, punctuality, and teamwork.

In addition to these, the pictures in the textbook convey other implicit values such as collaborative learning, nuclear family, parent's preferences of the sex of children, sympathy, pursuing higher education, independence, leadership, generosity, altruism, strength,



humanism, and bravery. All these values are presented implicitly through visual artifacts such as diagrams, pictures, graphs, and photographs. However, such values may go unnoticed by teachers and students due to the wrong assumption that visual texts are value-free. Consequently, no classroom discussion about them can take place.

The study concluded that although the textbook writers claim that the textbook aims to expose students to a myriad of cultural values, these were merely presented as lists of vocabulary items within particular lesson. That is, the objective behind their inclusion was purely linguistic rather than values related. The researcher noted that “there is no explicit value-integrated English instruction. No instructional prompts engage students in value-based English learning activities or tasks” (Widodo, 2018, p. 148). The textbook, then, fails to include values related discussions and learning tasks to foster values appropriation. However, values are implicitly present in narrative texts and visual artifact, but to exploit these in character education, teachers must be first aware of such implicit existence, and then make it explicit or reveal it to students through designing relevant classroom tasks and activities.

### **5.2. Values in Chinese EFL Textbooks**

Xiong and Hu (2022) show particular interest in the inclusion of moral and cultural values in EFL textbooks. This interest is derived from the proven relationship between culture and language in language education. Their study used the example of the value of benevolence, as present in a widely used EFL series in China, to show how values can be integrated into various activities and texts. The topic is relevant in its context, as well as in other contexts, because educational policy explicitly prioritizes values and values education. In China, the English curriculum is designed with both practical and human-centered objectives, aiming to support students' lifelong growth by cultivating positive character traits and instilling accurate perspectives and values.

The study applied an integrated social semiotic approach to evaluate the textbook series, with main focus on texts, images, and modes of communication as semiotic resources. In doing so, the researchers tried to answer two research questions related to how values are presented in EFL textbooks via texts and pictures used to facilitate learning, and to the ideological and pedagogical outcomes of using such teaching materials. Again, and like all the studies discussed in this chapter, the authors started by defining what is meant by values in their context. They “conceptualize values as social, cultural, and moral evaluations, judgment, and attitudes which guide individuals to think, feel, and behave in social and cultural contexts” (Xiong & Hu, 2022, p. 45). They also started from the premise that textbooks are cultural artifacts which are produced by taking many intentions and ideologies into account. In other words, they are value-laden, and all choices included are not arbitrary.

The data analyzed included one unit from *Oxford English* (2014), book 2 for grade 8. The unit was entitled “Helping those in Need,” and it obviously related to social values. The target value was benevolence, but other related values are included like altruism, etiquette, equality dedication, and justice. Data included three types of verbal and visual semiotic resources. The first one is discourse patterns; the researchers analyzed story events in the unit, even simplified and very short ones that are represented by short dialogues, a task or an image. In their analysis, the researcher used the Problem- Solution pattern (PS), which was developed by Hoey (1983, 2001). This pattern has four components: situation, problem, response, and result. It is widely used especially in story genre. The second one is lexical and semantic analysis wherein the researchers focused on how language is used to create evaluative meanings related to values such as good/bad, desirable/ undesirable, and important: unimportant. The third one is the multimodal analysis that combines both textual and visual elements and evaluates their roles in legitimizing values and practices. Here, the researchers mainly focused on facial expressions of characters in the textbook images and how they related to the context in which they were used.

For discourse pattern the unit contained four stories, and for pedagogical reasons some components of the PS patterns were omitted in each story as Figure 1 shows. However, no story omitted the Response component as it is the most important part that relates to moralization. The researchers then noted that Response can be value laden in that the way a response to a situation is constructed could help in the appropriation of positive attitudes and values. Hence, the PS pattern used in textbook narratives is a significant tool for conveying values.

		Extract 1	Extract 2	Extract 3	Extract 4
Components of PS pattern	Situation			✓	✓
	Problem			✓	✓
	Response	✓	✓	✓	✓
	Positive result or evaluation			✓	✓

**Figure 1. Components of Problem-Solution Patterns (Xiong & Hu, 2022, p. P50)**

For lexical and semantic analysis the researchers pointed to the use of verbs like “help” and “visit” (visiting sick children in hospital for example) which indicate an explicit commitment to benevolent behavior. Such verbs were dominant in all the texts included in the unit. However, the authors reached the same conclusion of Widodo (2018). The inclusion of value laden verbs and expression is “subordinate to the primary purpose of vocabulary-building in the textbook; that is, they are not designed chiefly to make students think about the implied values or take potential or real actions to help those in need” (Xiong & Hu, 2022, p. P50). In other words, the researchers confirmed previous research that values are dealt with implicitly rather than explicitly in EFL teaching materials.

Finally, for visual semiotic features, the study argued that pictures in the textbook, especially those displaying positive facial expressions, have crucial roles to play in constructing values and positive attitudes. With regard to the material analyzed, “a glimpse of the textbook shows that almost all the characters are wearing a smile in a more or less uniform way, suggesting generally positive attitudes and values” (Xiong & Hu, 2022, p. P51). Precisely, the studied unit contains 48 cartoon characters, mostly representing students and teachers, with 47 of them are smiling and looking happy and joyful in a context of helping others. The only character who is not smiling is a sick child receiving care in a hospital. Hence, facial expressions seem to play a complementary role with textual resources in building values. It is for this reason that the researchers concluded their study by suggesting that “in terms of textbook design and pedagogy, we believe that it is important to transform the conventional model of “pictures for exercises” to “pictures for values” (Xiong & Hu, 2022, p. P54).

### 5.3.Values in Palestinian EFL Textbooks

The work of Dweikat and Shbeitah (2016) is another example of research on values inclusion in teaching materials. They opted for North Star, a textbook for intermediate level, which is widely used in a number of countries, including Palestine. Like most researchers in this particular field, the authors started by reminding us that no language teaching can actually take place without evoking the culture of the language taught or learned and that a crucial component of any culture is the values system related to it. For this reason, according to the authors, most language textbooks intentionally include certain customs, rituals, arts, clothes, and ways of life associated with the geographical context where that language is spoken.

The study aimed to answer three related questions. They are all about the nature of Western values included in the North Star series and the extent to which some Arab or Islamic

values are detected in the various teaching activities in this textbook. The questions are legitimate as most textbook writers claim the inclusion of universal values in one way or in another, and because many Western, Arab, and Islamic values have, in fact that feature of universality.

Methodologically, the study opted for content analysis, with particular attention to coding the data to increase the reliability of the used method. As for the procedures, the researchers stated that the analysis involved a meticulous examination of each sentence, noting down the prevalent instances of each cultural value. In doing so, they resorted to the help of a teacher who has been using the textbook for five years. The results were grouped into categories to allow qualitative analysis to take place.

The results showed that cultural values are varied from one unit to another. Frequencies ranged from 18 to 274 occurrences depending on the main theme of the unit. The observed values were grouped into ten categories as follows:

- |                          |                       |
|--------------------------|-----------------------|
| - Ways of living         | - Economic values     |
| - Customs and traditions | - Historical values   |
| - Man-woman relation     | - Geographical values |
| - Political values       | - Literary values     |
| - Religious values       | - Social values       |

However, the majority of values relate to the American culture, and this was manifested in a number of examples like brand names (Chevrolet, McDonald's Pepsi-Cola), American cities (Hawaii, Washington. D.C), and politics (capital punishment in some states), in addition to other themes like plastic surgery in the US and how the idea of beauty has changed over time. Also, the textbook mentions a lot of places belonging to many countries like the USA (72 places), Germany (16 places), Russia (9 places), and Britain (8 places) etc... However, no Arab place was mentioned in the whole series.

The researchers concluded that the Arab and Islamic culture is totally marginalized. Even the word 'Arab' was mentioned only once and in a negative context. The word is used in a manner that even offends the Arabs. It appeared in an exercise in unit 10, which states that 'a man may have more than one wife,' to be matched with the option 'Arab.'

The authors concluded by recommending some suggestions for policy makers. The most important recommendation, however, is that textbooks written by foreigners should be analyzed to check the relevance of their cultural contents to the local context. This is in line with the view that if teaching materials are to echo certain educational philosophies, textbook writers should be aware of that philosophy beforehand and design their activities and contents accordingly. Imported textbooks may not be a suitable option if the inculcation of local values is set as a supreme learning outcome in a curriculum.

In the case of the current research, this is not an issue. The textbook analyzed were written by teams of Moroccan practitioners who served in the Ministry of National Education for many years. They based pedagogical choices of activities, tasks, exercises, texts, and perhaps images on previously communicated guidelines derived from the Moroccan national curriculum.

## 6. STUDENTS AND TEACHERS' PERCEPTIONS OF INCIVILITY

In this section, three studies pertaining to how students and teachers perceive incivility are included. This is crucial due to the fact that there is no consensus on what civil and uncivil behaviors are in an educational setting.

### 6.1. Students' Perceptions of Classroom Incivility

Bjorklund and Rehling (2009) tackled classroom civility from students' perspectives. The study includes students' definition of what civility and incivility entail in an educational setting and how often they are subject to uncivil behavior. This is important due to the slippery nature of the concept itself. On the one hand, what some teachers might consider as uncivil behavior might be considered acceptable by the students they teach. On the other hand, even teachers do not perceive incivility in a consensual way as; for instance, some teachers are disturbed when a student checks his or her mobile phone in class, while this is fine for many others. Like in many other related studies, the choice of the topic was justified by the noticeable decline in civility in the US. The researchers noted that uncivil behavior within educational settings can disrupt the learning process, negatively impact the overall educational atmosphere, and potentially weaken students' respect for and connection to their schools.

The study sought to answer two research questions. The first one related to what behaviors are considered uncivil by students themselves, while the second was about the types of uncivil behaviors students observe in their classrooms. To answer these two questions, 3316 students (2,225 female and 1,381 Male) from a public university were reached via email to participate in the study.

A survey contained 23 uncivil behaviors based on existing research. Students were asked to rate their frequency in their classes as well as to rate the degree of their incivility using a scale. 2 more clearly civil behaviors were added to the list to so as to identify informants who responded to the survey in an arbitrary way, and thus they were excluded at the data analysis phase.

Results revealed that students perceived the majority of the 23 behaviors included in the survey as uncivil but with varying degrees. The most uncivil behaviors according to informants, were talking in class, showing up to class under the effect of drugs, and using mobile phones. Naturally, the two added positive behavior were perceived as least uncivil (smiling in response to other's comment and displaying positive facial expressions). Because the 25 behaviors included in the survey are central to the research paper, which is conducted in a Moroccan context, it is important to list detailed results as reported by the researchers in figure 2 below:

**Mean Ratings of the Degree of Incivility of Student Classroom Behaviors Ranked From Most Uncivil to Least Uncivil Behaviors**

<i>Behavior</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>s.d.</i>
Continuing to talk after being asked to stop	4.50	.87
Coming to class under the influence of alcohol or drugs	4.45	1.01
Allowing a cell phone to ring	4.14	1.04
Conversing loudly with others	4.09	.97
Nonverbally showing disrespect for others	3.94	1.03
Swearing	3.79	1.19
Sleeping	3.67	1.18
Making disparaging remarks	3.61	1.03
Arriving late and/or leaving early	3.35	1.09
Text messaging	3.30	1.22
Packing up books before class is over	3.29	1.13
Using a palm pilot, iPod or computer for non-class activities	3.25	1.20
Getting up during class, leaving and returning	2.99	1.14
Nonverbally indicating dissatisfaction with an assignment, activity or grade	2.99	1.09
Fidgeting that distracts others	2.91	1.12
Doing homework for other classes	2.88	1.10
Displaying inattentive posture or facial expressions	2.81	1.04
Questioning the value of an assignment or activity	2.77	1.17
Reading non-class material	2.70	1.12
Discarding trash after class has begun	2.59	1.11
Eating and drinking	2.03	.96
Yawning	1.88	1.00
Noseblowing	1.86	1.04
Nodding or smiling in response to others' comments	1.72	1.09
Displaying attentive posture or facial expressions	1.60	1.06

**Figure 2. Classroom behaviors ranked from most uncivil to least uncivil (Bjorklund & Rehling, 2009, p. 16)**

For the second research question, students reported a number of behaviors which they perceive as uncivil. At the top of the list we find text messaging, packing up books before class ends, eating and drinking, being late for class, and displaying improper facial expressions. This shows that the behaviors which they ranked as most uncivil (see Figure 8) are rare.

The researchers recommended that educators should focus on the behaviors which students themselves perceived as uncivil. Once these occur in the classroom, an immediate reaction might be needed. Also, teachers, thanks to the study, have a list of uncivil behaviors that students observe most often. Hence, they could think about practical ways to address the use of mobile phones to send messages or eating and drinking in class for example.

### **6.2.Intentional vs Unintentional Classroom Incivility**

Farrell et al. (2016) attempted to measure student's attitudes toward school incivility and to classify such attitudes in a continuum. The authors first quoted the definition of civility from



Wilkins et al., 2010, p. 37 and conceptualized the term as “polite behaviors that maintain social harmony, or demonstrate respect for the humanity of an individual, important in maintaining a society” (Farrell et al., p. 577). Similarly, they defined incivility as any behavior, attitude, or action that may cause harm. Incivility was often measured through continuums ranging from direct to indirect or from proactive (to get something by stealing for example) to reactive (countering a behavior). For their current study, the authors came up with the intentional-unintentional continuum.

The declared objective of the study was to develop a scale for measuring the perceptions and attitudes of teenagers with regard to school incivility. In justifying the objective targeted, the authors pointed to the limited measures available now to assess adolescents’ views about incivility, and to the fact that most previous research focused on adults or university students. Hence, the scales used may not be relevant to adolescents.

In terms of methodology and procedures, 549 American secondary school students filled items measuring attitudes toward classroom incivility. Interestingly, participants in the study were aged between 11 and 18. It is almost the same age group of the research population (Moroccan students of middle and high schools) targeted in this project. Questionnaires were used to measure incivility (11 items), antisocial beliefs (11 items), friend antisocial behavior (7 items), conduct behaviors (5 items), and prosocial behaviors (5 items). An exploratory factor analysis was then conducted to confirm the emergence of subscales related to intentionality.

Table 2 below shows that the first factor consisted of uncivil behaviors perceived as intentional by informants, while the second factor included behaviors considered as unintentional. The two factors had high “internal-consistency reliabilities (intentional:  $\alpha = .86$ , unintentional:  $\alpha = .84$ ) and a large correlation between the two factors ( $r = .59$ )” (Farrell et al., 2016, p. 583)

**Table 2.** Descriptive Statistics and Standardized Factor Loadings for CFA on Final Incivility Items (N = 246).

Item	Factor 1	Factor 2	M (SD)
Posting nasty notes	0.77		1.22 (0.63)
Spreading rumors	0.88		1.30 (0.64)
Calling classmate names	0.75		1.39 (0.74)
Fighting with student	0.80		1.39 (0.83)
Making fun of classmate	0.68		1.60 (0.94)
Packing up books		0.53	3.04 (1.26)
Eating during class		0.70	2.36 (1.22)
Sending a text in class		0.74	2.34 (1.32)
Online during a lesson		0.80	1.89 (1.10)
Sleeping in class		0.76	1.76 (1.08)

(Farrell et al., 2016, p. 598)

In short, the study confirmed the researcher’s hypothesis as factor analysis indicated two subscales of classroom incivility which are related to the nature of the behavior as being either intentional or unintentional. This, according to the authors, overlaps a little bit with the proactive-reactive continuum as both proactive and intentional incivility are about doing harm to others.

The authors concluded their study by recommending that issues related to school incivility should be addressed during teenage. Otherwise, these behavior might become more serious or dangerous and, as a result, menace social stability in general. They maintained that during adolescence, it is imperative to tackle incivility before it escalates into more severe behaviors. Consequently, there is a growing need to prioritize the issue of classroom incivility, as it has the potential to influence both academic progress and personal growth

### **6.3. The Psychological Impacts of Bullying**

Researchers in the Moroccan context might be concerned with the potential impact(s) of some aspects of school incivility on students' learning in Moroccan schools. Incivility in this paper is conceptualized in such a relatively broad way that it includes school phenomena like bullying. The latter was the topic of investigation addressed by Halliday et al. (2021). Precisely, the authors explored how adolescents' academic and psychological outcomes are influenced by bullying. The study is a systematic review of existing literature on victimized individuals in educational contexts. Obviously, this work is central to the current research as it offered a concise summary of what many studies in different contexts concluded with regard to the topic.

The term bullying was first defined as "as the negative actions one (or a group) inflicts on another to cause intentional harm or discomfort, with these actions occurring repeatedly and over time" (Halliday et al., 2021, p. 1). The researchers classified bullying in four categories: verbal, physical, relational, and cyber. They then noted that the terms 'bullying' and 'peer victimization' are often used interchangeably in previous research.

The study collected 28 studies from five databases. These include Scopus, PsycINFO, Ovid MedLine, Embase, and Sociological Abstracts. All these studies either addressed bullying in early adolescence, or highlighted the impact of this phenomenon on academic and psychological incomes of students. Methodologically, "all studies used a prospective, longitudinal design with the exception of one which incorporated prospective and retrospective data" (Halliday et al., 2021, p. 5).

The analysis led to the identification of four themes, two for the academic outcomes and two for the psychological outcomes. At the psychological level, many studies associated bullying experiences with different levels of depression, distress, psychosis, suicidal thoughts, self-harming, and social anxiety. Some studies concluded that females experienced higher levels of these psychological issues compared to males. In addition to this, victims of bullying in early adolescence subsequently reported a dissatisfaction with family life and social life as well. In other words, those who were bullied found challenges in constructing and maintaining social relationships according to the reviewed research.

As for the academic outcomes, many empirical studies related bullying to poor achievement and low grades, especially in mathematics. Also, poor class performance was noted in activities like giving presentations, taking initiative in discussions, and reading assignments. The other theme that relates to academic achievement is the general negative attitude which bullied individuals developed towards school in general. This attitude is manifested in increased absenteeism, demotivation and low self-efficacy.

The findings reported in this study have some practical implications. School base-interventions to react to bullying should be made as early as possible to avoid the long term negative effects on students' psychological life and academic achievement. Intervention should target improving school climate, encouraging peer relationships, and friendships, and fostering a sense of belonging to the educational institution.

## **7. CONTEXTUAL VARIABLES RELATED TO SCHOOL INCIVILITY**

This section reviews some empirical studies which relate to the last thematic area set to drive the investigation in the current paper. The main concern here is on how classroom incivility could be impacted, both positively and negatively, by teachers' profiles, their classroom management skills, and the pedagogical choices they make on a daily basis. Also, some contextual variables might correlate to the types and degrees of uncivil behaviors observed in schools. These variables include family background, media exposure, school climate, and peer influence. The first study in this section relates to teacher's professional profile, while the second one is concerned with media impacts on violent behavior. The last

study shifts the focus to professional stress and school culture as other variables which interact with students' misbehavior.

### 7.1. The Role of Self-Disclosure, Nonverbal Immediacy, and Credibility

Miller et al. (2014) investigated the possible relationships between students' incivility on the one hand and instructor's professional practices of nonverbal immediacy, self-disclosure and credibility on the other. Incivility was described by the researchers as a menace the learning environment, and uncivil behaviors range from typical actions such as arriving late and leaving early, to less common transgressions like open disrespect, and even more alarming incidents such as verbal aggression and threats of harm.

Similarly the researcher described the three main variables. First, self-disclosure, as a communicative behavior that consists of sharing personal information, is often used by educators to appear friendly and encourage their students to feel at ease to actively take part in classroom discussions and events. It could help in creating a supportive and anxiety-free learning environment, and in raising students' interests in the subject taught. Second, nonverbal immediacy involves "the use of behaviors such as eye contact, smiling, direct body orientation, close proxemics, gesturing, vocal inflections, and physical contact while communicating" (Miller et al., 2014, p. 6). Such strategies are conducive to the establishment of good relations between teachers and students as they are mainly meant for establishing discipline and attracting attention. Third, the concept 'credibility' includes three components: trustworthiness, competence, and caring. Some research suggested that students who perceive their teachers as lacking credibility often display lower levels of motivation and less respect for them.

438 students participated in this study. They filled out a questionnaire related to their previous teacher's behaviors in addition to their own. Items covered nonverbal immediacy (My instructor smiles when talking to people), self-disclosure (My instructor often shares his/her likes and dislikes"), instructor credibility, and students' incivility.

Results of the study showed that teachers can be proactive and contribute into reducing incivility in their classes. First, when students perceive their instructor as credible, the frequency and degree of uncivil behavior becomes very low. Credibility in the study included being fair, using sense of humor, mastering technology, and displaying clarity. Also, credibility, according to the study, is related to nonverbal immediacy, which confirms prior research in this regard. However, nonverbal immediacy proved to have little effect on students' incivility. Finally, the study showed that negative self-disclosure encourages uncivil behavior and makes the relationship between students and teachers too informal. Hence, teachers should maintain an acceptable level of formality in dealing with students.

### 7.2. Media Exposure

A leading German study conducted by Krahé and Möller in 2011 investigated the relationship between media exposure and student violent and prosocial behavior in schools. The study followed the tragic 2009 event which shocked the German society; an adolescent aged 19 years old killed nine students and three teachers and injured many more by using a gun. In the German context, this event brought up discussions about the relationship between media and violence, and the study at hand attempted to offer valid, scientific, and reliable conclusions in this respect.

The sample included students from 86 classes in 14 secondary schools, and the total number was 1686 (49.6 % female, and 51.4 % male). Participants completed measures of habitual media exposure, while teachers rated both the prosocial and aggressive behavior of each participant and their academic achievement scores. This allowed for correlating the variables of exposure, aggressive behavior, prosocial behavior, and achievement.

To measure students' habitual media violence exposure students were asked to provide the frequency of watching some types of movies like adventure, horror, action, comedy, crime thrillers, and science fiction movies. Also, exposure to video games was measured, and games included many genres such as action, military strategy, and sport games. Interestingly, the researchers recruited media experts to rate and evaluate violent contents in each type of movie and game.

To measure students' normative acceptance of aggression, the researchers asked participants how they would react if they were in this situation:

Imagine you are extremely angry with one of your classmates because he/she treated you in a mean and unfair way in front of others that morning. After school you meet this person again and this time the two of you are alone. Immediately he/she starts quarrelling with you again, saying nasty things (Krahé & Möller, 2011, p. 282).

As expected, results showed that the majority of students reported high levels of exposure to media, especially movies and video games. The researchers conducted One way Anova which indicated important gender differences with regard to all variables. Boys showed high levels of media violence exposure and normative acceptance of aggression compared to girls. Also they were rated as more violent by their teachers. On the other hand, girls were rated as being more engaging in prosocial behavior than boys.

Despite these gender differences, correlation results were similar for both girls and boys. Exposure to violent media correlated negatively with teacher-rated prosocial behavior and positively with teacher-rated violent behavior. The researchers expected this. Also, media exposure significantly correlated with normative acceptance of aggression. The latter was similarly correlated with teacher-rated aggressive behavior. Finally, students' prosocial behavior did not correlate significantly with exposure to media content that is violence-free.

The findings, to conclude, supported prior research concerning the close relationship between adolescents' exposure to violent content in media and their predisposition to engage in violent behavior at school. The researchers stressed that "The aggressive content in media offers particular prompts that can be directly assimilated into users' cognitive and behavioral tendencies" Krahé & Möller, 2011, p. 304)

### **7.3. Teachers as Victims of School Violence**

Steffgen and Ewen (2007) studied the various causes as well as the frequency of violence against teachers by exploring two variables: strain and school culture in Luxemburg secondary schools. Previous research has, in fact, confirmed a rise in verbal and physical violence towards educators. Teachers who were subject to violent aggression usually "suffer from negative developmental outcomes, decreases in academic achievement, less supportive interpersonal relationships, and withdrawal, as well as negative social behavior, coping mechanisms, and social functioning" (Steffgen & Ewen, 2007, p. 82).

The researchers started with the assumption that school culture in general and school climate in particular are among the factors that contribute to school violence. They maintained that "in addition to the context of socialization outside the school (family, peer, media and leisure time), aspects of personality and school culture are implied in the occurrence of violence" (Steffgen & Ewen, 2007, p. 83). School cultures was defined in such a way to include teachers 'competence as well as socioecological school environment (class relationships, class cohesion, school facilities, and students' competition). Then, the authors set the following questions to guide their investigations:

- Does professional strain influence the occurrence of teacher victimization at school?
- Which organizational school culture aspects are related to the occurrence of the victimization of teacher? (Steffgen & Ewen, 2007, p. 84).

To answer these two questions, the study sample included 25% of all secondary school teachers in Luxemburg. The total number reached 829 teacher who received a questionnaire but only 399 returned it. The questionnaire measured three constructs: school culture, professional strain, and victimization.

Data analysis showed that 23.9% of participants reported being victims of violence many times a year. Violent acts included verbal attacks, stealing and damaging objects, telephone threats, physical harm, and sexual harassment. Female teachers were subject to these forms of violence more than their male counterparts.

A positive correlation was found between victimization and some aspects of teachers' strain, like time pressure and class-related stress. Similarly, negative school climate correlated positively with teachers' reports of being subject to violence. Regression analysis showed that class-oriented strain and the socio-ecological factors within the school environment hold substantial predictive power regarding the victimization experienced by teachers.

This widely cited study shows that identifying the factors that produce victims of violence in schools could help the school staff to address these factors directly. Improving the school environment and managing teachers' professional stress might be areas of immediate intervention in this regard.

## 8. EMPIRICAL RESEARCH IN MOROCCO

This section is devoted to examining how Moroccan researchers have approached the topics of values and values education. Three studies are discussed to highlight the scope and limitations of existing local research. The objective is to demonstrate a clear research gap: current studies in the Moroccan context do not comprehensively address the five thematic lenses outlined in this literature review, namely values in teacher training, values in teaching materials, perceptions of civility and incivility, the roles of certain contextual variables, and the roles of teachers in promoting civility. While some studies may touch upon one or two of these dimensions, they often do so only superficially. This paper argues that future research in Morocco should engage with all five areas in a more systematic and in-depth manner.

### 8.1. The Impact of Character Education on Moroccan Secondary School Students

Hassine (2022) investigated the impact of character education programs and activities on improving students' behaviors in Moroccan secondary schools. The study was motivated by the increasing rates of violence and misbehavior in schools, which have led to growing academic interest in character education and classroom disruptions. The research emphasizes that schools should not only develop students' academic skills but also guide them in acquiring social values and desirable personality traits.

The researcher highlighted the strong link between character education and moral behavior, noting that students with good character can distinguish between right and wrong and act accordingly. To foster such students, collaboration is needed among schools, families, media, and other organizations involved in education, culture, and mentorship. The choice of topic was justified by the urgent need to raise educators' awareness about the crucial role of values education in teaching, learning, and the school environment.



The study aimed to explore the actual impact of character education on student conduct, specifically through programs, the explicit teaching of values in the curriculum, and teacher modeling. A mixed-methods design was used: data were collected from 424 students via questionnaires and from 40 teachers through semi-structured interviews. Participants came from high schools in Fes, Agadir, Casablanca, Marrakech, Assila, and Kliaa, with a pilot test conducted in Casablanca and Agadir to increase validity.

Quantitative results showed that 93.3% of students viewed school primarily as a place for academic learning, not for learning behavior. Male students were perceived as more disruptive than females. Moreover, teachers who modeled values positively influenced students' understanding and practice of values, as well as their grasp of character traits in textbooks.

Qualitative data revealed that although teachers agreed on the importance of character education, they did not integrate values-related content into their lessons. They attributed this to the lack of pedagogical materials related to values and behavior in the textbooks.

In response, the researcher recommended several measures: teachers should receive specific training and supervision in character education to recognize their roles as moral educators and learn how to incorporate values into lessons. Additionally, teachers of all subjects should occasionally design lessons focused on teaching values and social norms. Finally, school clubs and extracurricular activities should be used to model and teach prosocial behavior, giving students space to express their opinions and take initiative.

### **8.2. Values in the Educational Context in Morocco: The Gap between Discourse and Practice"**

Bouklah (2020) argued that the stability and cohesion of any social group depend on shared values that regulate interactions among its members. From the outset, the author acknowledged the multiple definitions of values, but for his study, he defined them as the process of socialization occurring in schools, with the ultimate goal of preparing learners to fulfill future societal roles.

The author explained that values education has become increasingly challenging due to the rapid and "dangerous" changes in information and communication technologies. These changes, along with other contributing factors, have led to a values crisis that either originates in schools and spreads to society or vice versa. Despite the various reform projects in Morocco's educational system, none has succeeded in resolving this crisis.

The central problem addressed by the study is the paradox between the values promoted in educational discourse and those prevailing in society. Although school curricula aim to instill values reflective of Moroccan identity—such as respect, empathy, and tolerance—students often fail to adopt these values, as misbehavior and misconduct persist both inside and outside schools.

The study aimed to:

- (i) describe and explain the gap between educational discourse and social realities regarding values,
- (ii) identify the causes of the values crisis in Moroccan schools, and examine school violence as an indicator of this crisis, and

(iii) explore how values are conceptualized in Morocco's philosophy of education, curricula, and syllabi.

Methodologically, the study used a mixed approach. It involved document analysis of the NCET and other official texts to identify themes related to values. In addition, it utilized and analyzed official statistics on school violence, as reported by the Ministry of National Education.

The findings showed that values are given significant importance in official documents. The NCET emphasized Islamic values such as tolerance, moderation, fairness, cooperation, and solidarity. It also encouraged openness to universal values and the development of a sense of rights and responsibilities in students. The White Paper reinforced the same values and asserted that schools are the ideal context for education in values, ethics, human rights, and citizenship. It further emphasized personality traits like self-confidence, critical thinking, initiative, and hard work. These same values were echoed in later reform plans, including the HCETSR reports and the Strategic Vision reform.

Regarding textbooks, the study found they offer many opportunities to teach values, either directly or indirectly. However, the broad and generalized way in which values are addressed—without focusing on a specific “central value” (Bouklah, 2020, p. 20)—makes it difficult to effectively internalize them pedagogically.

The paper also presented noteworthy statistics on school violence. During one school year, 203 cases of violence were reported by national newspapers. This figure is significant, especially considering that not all incidents are reported by the media for various reasons. Table 3 provides a detailed breakdown of these cases.

Table 3. Violence statistics of the school year 2012/2013 (Bouklah, 2020, pp. 22–23)

Context of violent acts						
Urban areas		Rural areas		Inside school		Around school
77%		23%		52%		48%
Source of violence						
Student / Teacher	Student /student	Student/ adminstrator	Teacher/ administaro	Teacher / teacher	Administrator / administrator	Stangers/ students and professional s
21%	21%	8/%	3%	1%	1%	54%
Gender and violence						
Male to male		Male against female and vice versa			Female against female	
57%		41%			2%	

The conclusion drawn from the above statistical indicators is that school discourse has little impact on school reality. The latter, marked by alarming rates of violence, suggests that educational reform has yet to take root in Moroccan schools—at least in terms of values and values education. To address this situation, Bouklah (2020) recommended adopting a participatory and democratic approach that is accepted by all educational stakeholders and supported by broad societal consensus. He also emphasized the need to invest in (i) school infrastructure through adequate financial resources, (ii) human capital responsible for

educational processes, and (iii) updating current curricula to enable the educational system to meet social needs—not only academically, but also in terms of social skills and ethics.

### **8.3. The Values of Religious Tolerance in Moroccan ELT Textbooks**

Ait Bouzid (2016) conducted a study on the representation of religious themes related to tolerance in three English textbooks used in the final year of secondary education in Morocco. The study starts from the idea that religious intolerance is largely due to a lack of awareness about other people's value systems and the reinforcement of negative stereotypes by the media. Addressing this issue is particularly relevant in Morocco, as the country hosts many sub-Saharan students with diverse religious backgrounds, and Moroccan youth have occasionally been influenced by extremist ideologies.

The research problem is rooted in the observation that Moroccans generally lack sufficient knowledge about other religions and their values. According to Ait Bouzid (2016), this ignorance can lead to conflict and rivalry among groups with different religious affiliations, undermining efforts to promote diversity, peaceful coexistence, and tolerance at local, regional, and global levels.

The study adopted a mixed-methods approach. Content analysis was used, combining both quantitative and qualitative data to examine religious content in three selected textbooks: Ticket to English 2 (Hammani, Ahssen & Tansaoui, 2007), Gateway to English 2 (Hassim, Blibil & Rasmy, 2007), and Insights into English 2 (Najbi & El Haddad, 2007). First, the textbooks were quantitatively analyzed in terms of the number and frequency of religious references, including texts, images, and activities. Then, a qualitative analysis described the nature and pedagogical presentation of the content. Both sets of findings were triangulated to enhance the reliability of the results.

The study concluded that religious content is scarce in all three textbooks. A total of only 17 references to religion were found, and these were unevenly distributed among the three major religions—Islam, Christianity, and Judaism. Specifically, 8 references were about Islam, 1 about Christianity, and the remaining 8 were non-specific and “indefinite by nature” (Ait Bouzid, 2016, p. 95).

The qualitative findings confirmed the quantitative ones. Islam dominated the religious content, while themes promoting tolerance, diversity, and peaceful coexistence were largely absent. Ait Bouzid (2016) noted that this finding is consistent with existing literature, which suggests that textbooks tend to focus only on local religions.

The study is relevant to this research project because it highlights the mismatch between Morocco's national philosophy of education and official educational discourse on the one hand, and the actual textbooks used on the other. In a textbook composed of 10 units, each with at least 7 lessons containing numerous activities, the inclusion of only 17 references to religion shows a clear lack of emphasis on religious values. This contradicts curriculum declarations, which list the values of Islam as a top priority in the Moroccan educational system.

## **9. CONCLUSION**

This paper included a number of studies, each of which related directly to one of the five thematic areas mentioned earlier. The included articles revealed that teachers use a number of pedagogical tips, such as discussion and collaborative learning methodologies, to cope with values-related issues. Also, institutional measures taken by local schools, such as character education programs, proved to have varying degrees of efficacy. The literature also indicated

that values education is often missing in teacher training programs and in EFL teaching materials. This results in teachers' neglect of this area, which in turn leads to the persistence of misbehavior and violence in the classroom. Finally, some studies showed significant correlations between media exposure, teachers' competence, and school climate on the one hand, and verbal and physical violence in schools on the other.

The literature surveyed in this paper, while rich and varied, suggests that certain aspects of values education should be empirically explored within the Moroccan context, in order to compare and contrast the findings with international research. These encompass the five interconnected themes that form the basis of the current paper:

- ✓ The approaches and strategies employed by Moroccan EFL teachers to integrate the teaching of values into the English curriculum.
- ✓ The presence or absence of values-related content in pre-service and in-service teacher training programs in Morocco.
- ✓ The integration of values education in the currently used EFL textbooks.
- ✓ Moroccan students and teachers' perceptions of what counts as civil and uncivil behavior.
- ✓ The interaction between contextual variables and students' civility and incivility.

## REFERENCES

- Ait-Bouazid, H. (2016). Promoting values of religious tolerance through Moroccan ELT textbooks. *ASIAN TEFL: Journal of Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics*, 1(2), 89-100.
- Bandura, A. (1977). Self-Efficacy: Toward a unifying theory of behavioral change. *Psychology Review*, 84(2), 191-215.
- Berkowitz, M. W., & Bier, M. C. (2005). What works in character education: A research-driven guide for educators.
- Bjorklund, W. L., & Rehling, D. L. (2009). Student perceptions of classroom incivility. *College teaching*, 58(1), 15-18.
- Bouklah, M. (2020). Values system between the educational discourse and social reality. *Journal of education and training*. Volume 3, 12-26.
- Boyd, R. (2006). 'The Value of Civility?' *Urban Studies*, Vol. 43, Nos 5/6, 863-878.
- Bryant, C. G. (1995). Civic Nation, Civil Society, Civil Religion. Pp. 136-57 in *Civil Society: Theory, History, Comparison*, edited by John A. Hall. Cambridge, MA: Polity Press.
- Clark, C. M., & Carnosso, J. (2008). Civility: A concept analysis. *Journal of Theory Construction & Testing*, 12(1).
- Cohen, B. (2006). Urbanization in developing countries: Current trends, future projections, and key challenges for sustainability. *Technology in society*, 28(1-2), 63-80.
- Dewey, J. (1909). *Moral Principles In Education*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Dewey, J. (1909). *Moral principles in education*. Houghton Mifflin.
- Dewey, J. (1916). *Democracy and Education*. New York: Free Press, Macmillan.
- Dewey, J. (1916). *Democracy and Education*. New York: Free Press, Macmillan.
- DuPont, R. L., Campbell, T. G., & Mazza, J. J. (2002). United States Department of Education Office of Elementary and Secondary Education Safe and Drug-Free Schools Program.
- Dweikat, K. A., & Shbeith, G. (2016). Investigating the cultural values in EFL textbooks: a case study of NorthStar intermediate textbook. *مجلة الجامعة الإسلامية للدراسات التربوية والنفسية*, 21(1).
- Farrell, A. H., Provenzano, D. A., Spadafora, N., Marini, Z. A., & Volk, A. A. (2016). Measuring adolescent attitudes toward classroom incivility: Exploring differences

- between intentional and unintentional incivility. *Journal of Psychoeducational Assessment*, 34(6), 577-588.
- Ferriss, A.L (2002). Studying and Measuring Civility: A Framework, Trends, and Scale. *Sociological Inquiry*, Vol. 72, No. 3, Summer 2002, 376–92
- Halliday, S., Gregory, T., Taylor, A., Digenis, C., & Turnbull, D. (2021). The impact of bullying victimization in early adolescence on subsequent psychosocial and academic outcomes across the adolescent period: A systematic review. *Journal of school violence*, 20(3), 351-373.
- Hassine, R. (2022). Implementing Character Education and Behavior Improvement in Moroccan Secondary Schools. *European Journal of Education and Pedagogy*, 3(2), 128-134.
- Higher Council for Education, Training and Scientific Research (CSEFRS). (1999). The National Charter of Education and Training.
- Hoey, M. (1983). *On the surface of discourse*. London: Allen & Unwin.
- Kauffman, J.M & Burbach, H.J (1997). On Creating a Climate of Classroom Civility. *The Phi Delta Kappan*, Dec., 1997, Vol. 79, No. 4 (Dec., 1997), pp. 320-325
- Krahé, B., & Möller, I. (2011). Links between self-reported media violence exposure and teacher ratings of aggression and prosocial behavior among German adolescents. *Journal of Adolescence*, 34(2), 279-287.
- Merrell, K. W., Gueldner, B. A., Ross, S. W., & Isava, D. M. (2008). How effective are school bullying intervention programs? A meta-analysis of intervention research. *School psychology quarterly*, 23(1), 26.
- Miller, A. N., Katt, J. A., Brown, T., & Sivo, S. A. (2014). The relationship of instructor self-disclosure, nonverbal immediacy, and credibility to student incivility in the college classroom. *Communication Education*, 63(1), 1-16.
- Milson, A. J., & Mehlig, L. M. (2002). Elementary school teachers' sense of efficacy for character education. *The journal of educational research*, 96(1), 47-53.
- Mohamed, N., Sihes, A. J., Bohari, N. M., & Uda, A. (2020). A Systematic Review: Teacher's Roles in Implementing Values Education. *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation*, 24(05).
- Narvaez, D. (2002). Does reading moral stories build character?. *Educational Psychology Review*, 14, 155-171.
- Nucci, L., Narvaez, D., & Krettenauer, T. (2014). Citizenship Education in the United States: Regime Type, Foundational Questions, and Classroom Practice WA LT ERC. PARKER. In *Handbook of Moral and Character Education* (pp. 363-383). Routledge.
- Pearson, C. M., Andersson, L. M., & Wegner, J. W. (2001). When workers flout convention: A study of workplace incivility. *Human relations*, 54(11), 1387-1419.
- Peck, D.L (2002). Civility: A Contemporary Context for a Meaningful Historical Concept. *Sociological Inquiry*, Vol. 72, No. 3, Summer 2002, 358–75
- Revell, L., & Arthur, J. (2007). Character education in schools and the education of teachers. *Journal of Moral Education*, 36(1), 79-92.
- Schuitema, J., Dam, G. T., & Veugelers, W. (2008). Teaching strategies for moral education: A review. *Journal of curriculum studies*, 40(1), 69-89.
- Sela-Shayovitz, R. (2009). Dealing with school violence: The effect of school violence prevention training on teachers' perceived self-efficacy in dealing with violent events. *Teaching and teacher education*, 25(8), 1061-1066.
- Steffgen, G., & Ewen, N. (2007). Teachers as victims of school violence. The influence of strain and school culture. *International journal on violence and schools*, 3(1), 81-93. *Studies in Education*, 5(2), 101–115.



- Thornberg, R. (2008). School children's reasoning about school rules. *Research papers in education*, 23(1), 37-52.
- Waters, S., & Russell III, W. B. (2014). Preservice secondary teachers' sense of efficacy in teaching character education. *Journal of Education*, 194(2), 45-54.
- Widodo, H. P. (2018). A critical micro-semiotic analysis of values depicted in the Indonesian Ministry of National Education-endorsed secondary school English textbook. In *Situating moral and cultural values in ELT materials* (pp. 131-152). Springer, Cham.
- Wilkins, K., Caldarella, P., Crook-Lyon, R., & Young, K. R. (2010). Implications of Civility for Children and Adolescents: A Review of the Literature. *Issues in Religion and Psychotherapy*, v33 p37-45
- Wilkins, K; Caldarella, P; Crook-Lyon, R; and Young, K., (2010) "The Civil Behavior of Students: A Survey of School Professionals". Brigham Young University .Faculty Publications
- Xiong, T., & Hu, G. (2022). Designing Values in English as a Foreign Language Textbooks: A Social Semiotic Approach. In *Cultural Knowledge and Values in English Language Teaching Materials* (pp. 41-61). Springer, Singapore.